in "shocking ways that violate elementary norms of academic freedom and of tenure"; use of committees and consultations "for symbolic show only—wasting hundreds of hours of faculty and staff time just to arrive at exactly the conclusions proclaimed in advance by the president"; efforts to "turn our deans into transmission belts to implement centralized directives"; and, finally, an obsession "with claiming personal credit for all that happens that is good—and [determination] to blame others when he messes up."

The challenge to FAS, Skocpol concluded, was "how do we want to proceed in addressing the pathologies of leadership that are undermining the honor, the competitive effectiveness, and the collegial governance of Harvard University?"

For the balance of the meeting and its continuation a week later, indictments spilled out, fueled by events public and private: the president's 2001 confrontation with then-Fletcher University Professor Cornel West, who decamped for Princeton; disagreements on the process for and likely outcome of Allston planning, particularly for science facilities; Summers's remarks at Morning Prayers in September 2002, when he criticized the actions of supporters of divestiture from Israel as anti-Semitic "in their effect if not their intent"—which some faculty members took as a form of labeling that precluded, rather than promoted, debate; the perception that certain disciplines are privileged over others; Summers's 2003 Commencement address, seen by some as claiming that the curriculum was more a presidential creation than FAS's, and as a directive about where the then-nascent review ought to end up.

Such sentiments were not universal. Ruth Wisse, Peretz professor of Yiddish literature and professor of comparative literature, denounced "the